

Discussion

Editorial Statement: Replication Studies in *Schmollers Jahrbuch*

The editors of *Schmollers Jahrbuch* consider replicability of published results to be essential to make empirical findings credible and a useful basis for further research. As McCullough and Vinod (2003, p. 888) recently put it: “Replication is the cornerstone of science. Research that cannot be replicated is not science, and cannot be trusted either as part of the profession’s accumulated body of knowledge or as a basis for policy.” Therefore, in our editorial statement published in issue 4 of volume 124 we announced that we will attempt to encourage and facilitate replication studies. Such replication studies can either use the same data as a previously published study and report errors or the lack of robustness of reported results, or it can use different data to replicate (or not) the findings of the earlier study, keeping in mind what Daniel Hamermesh (2000, p. 376) told us: “(T)he credibility of a new finding that is based on carefully analyzing two data sets is far more than twice that of a result based only on one.” Researchers interested in performing a replication study to be published in *Schmollers Jahrbuch* are encouraged to contact Joachim Wagner <wagner@uni-lueneburg.de> to discuss details in advance.

Ideally, the starting point of such a replication study should be a paper published recently in this journal. However, exceptions are possible. One such exception is the study by Kornelius Kraft that is published here, using the same data set that Bernd Frick used in a contribution published ten years ago in *Labour*. The study by Kraft and the reply by Frick are included in this issue both because the impact of works councils on firm performance has been the topic of several papers published in *Schmollers Jahrbuch* in the past, and to illustrate how important such exercises can be. We are looking forward to discuss ideas for other replication studies, and to publish more papers of this type in the future.

Joachim Wagner

References

- Hamermesh, D.* (2000): The Craft of Labormetrics, *Industrial and Labor Relations Review* 53, 363–380.
- McCullough, B. D./ Vinod, H. D.* (2003): Verifying the Solution from a Nonlinear Solver: A Case Study, *American Economic Review* 93, 873–892.