

Foreword to the Translation of Gustav Schmoller’s Reviews of Carl Menger’s “Principles,” “Investigations,” and “Errors”

By Karen Horn* and Stefan Kolev**

The famous dispute on method, the *Methodenstreit*, opposed Carl Menger (1840–1921) and Gustav Schmoller (1838–1917).¹ Menger, the founding father of the Austrian School, is well known for his contributions to the subjective theory of value and to marginalism. Twelve years after his *Grundsätze der Volkswirtschaftslehre (Principles of Economics)* (Menger [1871] 1976), he published a sequel focusing on methodology, *Untersuchungen über die Methode der Socialwissenschaften und der Politischen Oekonomie insbesondere (Investigations into the Method of the Social Sciences with Special Reference to Economics)* (Menger [1883] 1985). He insisted on distinguishing the historical and statistical study of economic forms, theoretical economics, as well as practical fields such as economic policy and public finance, and argued that the historical study, while useful, was only complementary to theory and should not seek to replace it. Upon reading the *Investigations*, Gustav Schmoller, the leader of the emerging Younger German Historical School who had reviewed earlier Menger’s *Principles* without much enthusiasm (Schmoller 1873), found himself under attack and answered with an unfavorable, in some parts even personally insulting review (Schmoller 1883) in this *Jahrbuch*. Interestingly enough, Menger’s *Investigations* were published by the same press which – back then and today – publishes the *Jahrbuch*: Duncker & Humblot.² It is these reviews which the NOUS Network for Constitutional Economics and Social Philosophy found important to translate and is proud to present here.

While Menger’s *Investigations* were translated in 1963 on the 80th anniversary of their publication and have thus been accessible to English-speaking scholars for a long time, Schmoller’s review of the *Principles* was translated much later (Caldwell 2004,

* Faculty of Economics, Law and Social Sciences, University of Erfurt. Nordhäuser Str. 63,99089 Erfurt, Germany. The author can be reached at karen.horn@uni-erfurt.de.

** Faculty of Business and Economics, University of Applied Sciences Zwickau. Kornmarkt 1, 08056 Zwickau, Germany. The author can be reached at stefan.kolev@fh-zwickau.de.

¹ For background and interpretation on the dispute, see Horn and Kolev (2020) and Kolev and Dekker (2023).

² Schmoller had even encouraged Duncker & Humblot’s owner Carl Geibel to publish the *Investigations*, and despite the heat of the dispute did not regret this recommendation, see Herold (2019), 204–9.